

## STATE OF NEW JERSEY Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350 www.nj.gov/bpu/

**ENERGY** 

)

)

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS ORDER APPROVING STIPULATION

DOCKET NO. GR18050585

Parties of Record:

Andrew Dembia, Esq., New Jersey Natural Gas Company Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director, New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel

BY THE BOARD:

By this Order, the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board" or "BPU") considers a stipulation of settlement ("Stipulation") executed by New Jersey Natural Gas Company ("NJNG" or "Company"), the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") and Board Staff ("Staff") (collectively, the "Parties") intended to resolve the Company's Annual Energy Efficiency Programs rate filing.

## BACKGROUND AND PROCEDURAL HISTORY

On July 17, 2009, the Board authorized NJNG to implement three energy efficiency programs: 1) Home Performance with Energy Star ("HPwES") Enhancements; 2) Enhanced Warm Advantage Rebate Program; and 3) Commercial Customer Direct Install Program<sup>1</sup> ("Original Programs"). The Original Programs were designed to complement or supplement existing New Jersey Clean Energy Program ("NJCEP") offerings including the ongoing WarmAdvantage, COOLAdvantage, HPES, Commercial Direct Install and Smart Start Building programs.

The Original Programs were available to eligible customers for approximately twelve (12) months. In the event there was still program funding available after that period, NJNG could continue to offer the approved programs through December 31, 2010. NJNG was authorized to establish the Energy Efficiency rate ("EE Rate") through which it would recover or return to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> In re Energy Efficiency Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms and In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of Energy Efficiency Programs with an Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism, BPU Docket Nos. EO09010056 and GO09010057 (July 17, 2009).

Agenda Date: 12/18/18 Agenda Item: 2H

customers all deferred program costs, including rebate costs, customer incentive payments, customer financing costs, and associated reasonable and prudent operations and maintenance expenses. These costs were to be recovered through the Company's Rider F. The Company was required to submit an annual cost recovery filing to establish future EE Rates. The annual filing includes updates to the investment levels, operating costs, and reconciled rate recovered to actual cost results.

By Order dated September 24, 2010, the Board authorized NJNG to extend and expand the Original Programs through December 31, 2011<sup>2</sup> ("September 2010 Order"). In addition to authorizing modifications to the Original Programs, the September 2010 Order also authorized the Company to implement an OPOWER pilot through which customers obtain information about their specific energy use in comparison to comparable households, an incremental incentive for Combined Heat and Power ("CHP") projects undertaken in conjunction with NJCEP, and a program that offers eligible commercial customers an opportunity for customized provisions, Fostering Environmental and Economic Development ("FEED") (collectively, "SAVEGREEN Project" or "SAVEGREEN").

By Order dated January 18, 2012, the Board authorized NJNG to continue its existing SAVEGREEN Project and implement certain proposed SAVEGREEN Project program changes through December 31, 2012, or twelve months from the date the Order approving the SAVEGREEN extension was served, whichever was later<sup>3</sup> ("January 2012 Order"). By Order dated June 21, 2013 ("June 2013 Order"), the Board authorized NJNG to further extend the SAVEGREEN Project, with modifications, through June 30, 2015.<sup>4</sup> The SAVEGREEN Project was further extended through July 31, 2017 by Order dated July 23, 2015<sup>5</sup> ("July 2015 Order"). The SAVEGREEN Project was further extended through December 31, 2018 by Order dated June 29, 2016<sup>6</sup> ("June 2016 Order"). By Order dated September 17, 2018, the Board approved both the continuation of existing and creation of new energy-efficiency programs to be offered through the SAVEGREEN Project through December 31, 2021.<sup>7</sup>

As part of the current cost recovery mechanism, NJNG is authorized to amortize for recovery the SAVEGREEN investments in customer rebates, incentive payments and customer financing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas for Approval of Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GO10030225 (September 24, 2010).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas for Approval of Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GR11070425 (January 19, 2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Extension of Energy Efficiency Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1 and In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Cost Recovery Associated with Energy Efficiency Program, BPU Docket Nos. GO12070640 and GR12070641 (June 21, 2013).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Extension of Energy Efficiency Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GO14121412 (July 23, 2015).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Extension of Energy Efficiency Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GO14121412 (June 29, 2016).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of Existing and New Energy Efficiency Programs and a Class I Renewable Energy Program and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GO18030355 (September 17, 2018).

over a two-, three-, five- and ten-year period on a straight-line basis, with the rate of return on the unamortized SAVEGREEN investments approved in the previous orders. NJNG computes the rate of return component of its costs, in addition to deducting the accumulated amortization of its investments, by deducting the applicable deferred income taxes related to the amortization of rebates, incentives and financing costs over a two-, three-, five-, and ten-year period for book purposes and over a one-year period for tax purposes.

NJNG was required to submit its annual cost recovery filing by June 1, 2018 to establish future Rider F rates.

#### May 2018 Filing

By petition dated May 25, 2018, NJNG filed a request with the Board, wherein the Company proposed to decrease the EE Rate of \$0.0265 per therm (including Sales and Use Tax ("SUT")) to \$0.0161 per therm (including SUT), for recovery of the costs associated with the SAVEGREEN Project ("2018 Petition"). According to the 2018 Petition, based on actual information through April 30, 2018, and estimated information through December 31, 2018, NJNG anticipated being over recovered at December 31, 2018, by approximately \$3.233 million. Based on the current and anticipated levels of activity in SAVEGREEN, NJNG estimated the revenue requirement for the period January 2019 through December 2019 to be approximately \$10.715 million.

Since the 2018 Petition requested a rate reduction, public hearings on the 2018 Petition were not required. Rate Counsel and Staff propounded discovery on NJNG, which was responded to by the Company. NJNG updated its revenue requirement to include actual information through September 30, 2018 to reflect an over recovery of \$1.389 million. The Company's updated information indicates an anticipated over recovery at December 31, 2018, of approximately \$3.040 million and a revenue requirement for the period January 2019 through December 2019 to be approximately \$8.880 million.

#### STIPULATION

Following discovery, the Parties reached a settlement of all issues and on December 6, 2018 executed the Stipulation. The Stipulation provides the following:<sup>8</sup>

- 10. The Parties agree that the Company is authorized to recover only those costs associated with the SAVEGREEN Programs previously approved in the September 2010, January 2012, June 2013, July 2015, June 2016, and September 2018 Orders.
- 11. Based on the Company's updated revenue requirement of \$8.880 million, the Parties agree that NJNG should reduce the existing EE Rate of \$0.0265 per therm, which includes SUT (\$0.0249 excluding SUT), to \$0.0133 per therm aftertax (\$0.0125 excluding SUT) pursuant to the terms of Rider F of the Company's gas tariff, as set forth in Attachment A of the Stipulation. The Company's updated revenue requirement reflects implications of the Tax Cuts and Jobs Act

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Although summarized in this Order, should there be any conflict between this summary and the Stipulation, the terms of the Stipulation control, subject to the findings and conclusion in this Order. Each paragraph is numbered to coincide with the Stipulation.

of 2017. The overall bill of the residential heating customer using 100 therms per month will decrease by \$1.32, or 1.3 percent. This rate shall be effective January 1, 2019 or as of the date approved in a Board Order and shall remain in effect until changed by a future Board Order.

- 12. The Parties agree that actual costs incurred prior to September 30, 2018, as shown in Attachment B of the Stipulation, have been reviewed and deemed prudent and reasonable by the Parties. Actual costs incurred by NJNG after that date are subject to review for reasonableness and prudence in future EE Rate filings.
- 13. The Parties agree that the Company's next annual EE Rate filing will be made on or about June 1, 2019.
- 14. As agreed to by the Parties and authorized in the September 2010, January 2012, June 2013, July 2015, June 2016, and September 2018 Orders, any variance between costs and recoveries will accrue interest at a rate equal to the Company's monthly commercial paper rate. In the event that commercial paper was not utilized by the Company in the preceding month, the last calculated rate will be used. The interest rate shall not exceed the Company's rate of return as authorized by the BPU in the Company's most recent base rate case, BPU Docket No. GR15111304, or until changed by Board Order. Interest on over/under recoveries will be calculated using simple interest, based on the average beginning and ending over/under recovery balances for the month, on a net-of-tax basis. The sum of the monthly interest to be collected from or credited to ratepayers will be included in the rate calculations for the next annual EE Rate filing.

## DISCUSSION AND FINDING

The Board has carefully reviewed the record, including the 2018 Petition, as well as the Stipulation. Accordingly, the Board is satisfied and <u>HEREBY</u> <u>FINDS</u> that the Stipulation represents a fair and reasonable resolution of the issues, demonstrates that the costs have been reviewed and determined to be both reasonable and prudent, and is therefore in the public interest. The Board <u>HEREBY</u> <u>ADOPTS</u> the attached Stipulation as its own, incorporating by reference its terms and conditions as if fully set forth herein.

Accordingly, the Board <u>HEREBY ORDERS</u> that NJNG'S EE Rate be reduced to \$0.0133 per therm, including SUT, for service rendered on or after January 1, 2019. As a result of the Board's approval of the Stipulation, the monthly bill impact for a typical residential customer using 100 therms per month will be a decrease of \$1.32 or 1.3 percent, resulting in an average monthly bill from \$97.89 to \$96.57.

The Board <u>HEREBY</u> <u>ORDERS</u> the Company to file the appropriate revised tariff sheets consistent with the terms of this Order no later than January 1, 2019.

The Company's costs, including those related to the programs described above, remain subject to audit by the Board. This Decision and Order shall not preclude nor prohibit the Board from taking any actions determined to be appropriate as a result of any such audit.

This Board Order shall be effective on December 28, 2018.

DATED: 12/18/18

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY:

JOSEPH L. FIORDALISO PRESIDENT

MA

COMMISSIONER

UPENDRA J. CHIVUKULA COMMISSIONER

DIANNE<sup>1</sup>SOLOMON

COMMISSIONER

ROBERT M. GORDON

COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

- MOONQ AIDA CAMACHO-WELCH SECRETARY

HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original In the files of the Board of Public Utilities.

## IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH ENERGY EFFICENCY PROGRAMS

## BPU DOCKET NO. GR18050585

### SERVICE LIST

## New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel

Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003

Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director sbrand@rpa.nj.gov

Brian O. Lipman, Esq. blipman@rpa.nj.gov

Kurt Lewandowski, Esq. klewandowski@rpa.nj.gov

Felicia Thomas-Friel, Esq. <u>fthomas@rpa.nj.gov</u>

#### NJNG

New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road Post Office Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

Andrew Dembia, Esq. adembia@njng.com

Tina Trebino ttrebino@njng.com

France Karras fkarras@ning.com

James Corcoran jcorcoran@njng.com New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Aida Camacho-Welch Secretary of the Board Board.secretary@bpu.nj.gov

#### Division of Energy

Stacy Peterson, Director stacy.peterson@bpu.nj.gov

Paul Lupo, Bureau Chief paul.lupo@bpu.nj.gov

Andrea Reid andrea.reid@bpu.nj.gov

Counsel's Office

Rachel Boylan, Esq. rachel.boylan@bpu.nj.gov

Division of Law Department of Law & Public Safety Division of Law Post Office Box 45029 Newark, NJ 07101-45029

Caroline Vachier, Esq. caroline.vachier@law.njoag.gov

Geoffrey Gersten, Esq. geoffrey.gersten@law.njoag.gov

Alex Moreau, Esq. alex.moreau@law.njoag.gov

Renee Greenberg, Esq. renee.greenberg@law.njoag.gov

BPU DOCKET NO. GR18050585



December 6, 2018

Honorable Aida Camacho-Welch, Secretary New Jersey Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3rd Floor Suite 314 P.O.Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

## Re: In the Matter of the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Cost Recovery Associated with Energy Efficiency Programs BPU Docket No. GR18050585

Dear Secretary Camacho Welch:

Enclosed with this letter is a fully executed Stipulation of settlement in the above captioned matter. Original signatures for each signatory will be forwarded to the BPU once they have been received.

Please do not hesitate to contact me at 732-938-1073 if you need any additional information.

Very truly yours,

Andrew K. Dembia Regulatory Affairs Counsel

AKD:fk Cc: Service List (electronically only)

## IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS BPU DOCKET NO. GR18050585

## SERVICE LIST

## <u>NJNG</u>

Mark G. Kahrer New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

Andrew K. Dembia New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

Tina Trebino New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

France Karras New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

James M. Corcoran New Jersey Natural Gas Company 1415 Wyckoff Road P.O. Box 1464 Wall, NJ 07719

## NJ BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

Stacy Peterson, Director N.J. Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Suite 314 P.O. Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Oneil Hamilton N.J. Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Suite 314 P.O. Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Rachel Boylan, Legal Specialist N.J. Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Suite 314 P.O. Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Andrea Reid N.J. Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Suite 314 P.O. Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350

Bethany Roque-Romaine N.J. Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350

## IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS BPU DOCKET NO. GR18050585

## SERVICE LIST

#### DIVISION OF RATE COUNSEL

Stefanie A. Brand, Esq Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625

Felicia Thomas-Friel, Esq. Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625

Brian Lipman, Litigation Manager Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625

Kurt Lewandowski, Esq Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625

## DEPT. OF LAW & PUBLIC SAFETY -DIVISON OF LAW

Caroline Vachier, Section Chief Deputy Attorney General Dept. of Law & Public Safety – Div of Law 124 Halsey Street P.O. Box 45029 Newark, NJ 07101

Alex Moreau Deputy Attorney General Dept. of Law & Public Safety – Div of Law 124 Halsey Street P.O. Box 45029 Newark, NJ 07101

Renee Greenberg Deputy Attorney General Dept. of Law & Public Safety – Div of Law 124 Halsey Street P.O. Box 45029 Newark, NJ 07101

## STATE OF NEW JERSEY BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

# IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY FOR APPROVAL OF THE COST RECOVERY ASSOCIATED WITH ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS

STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT

BPU DOCKET NO. GR18050585

#### **APPEARANCES:**

Andrew Dembia, Esq., New Jersey Natural Gas Company for the Petitioner, New Jersey Natural Gas Company

)

Felicia Thomas-Friel, Esq., Deputy Rate Counsel, and Kurt Lewandowski, Esq., Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel (Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel)

Alex Moreau and Renee Greenberg, Deputy Attorneys General, for the Staff of the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities (Gurbir S. Grewal, Attorney General of New Jersey)

## **TO: THE NEW JERSEY BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES**

1. On May 29, 2018, New Jersey Natural Gas Company ("NJNG" or "Company") filed a petition ("Petition") in Docket No. GR18050585 with the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board" or "BPU") requesting that the Board reduce the Company's existing Energy Efficiency ("EE") rate of \$0.0265 per therm [including Sales and Use Tax ("SUT")], which was established by Board Order dated October 20, 2017, in Docket No. GR17060587, to \$0.0161 per therm (including SUT). The Company submitted the Petition pursuant to the terms of earlier Board

Orders.<sup>1</sup> On September 17, 2018, the Board issued an Order<sup>2</sup> in Docket No. GO18030355 approving both the continuation of existing and creation of new energy-efficiency programs to be offered through the SAVEGREEN Project® ("SAVEGREEN"). The September 2018 Order authorized NJNG to offer the SAVEGREEN programs through December 31, 2021 and authorized the continued recovery of SAVEGREEN investments and operating costs collected through the Board-approved NJNG Tariff Sheet Rider F ("Rider F"). These Orders all adopted terms of stipulations entered into among the Company, Board Staff, and the New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") (collectively the "Parties").

Based on the current and anticipated levels of activity in SAVEGREEN and the projected over-recovered balance of \$3.040 million as of December 31, 2018, the current after-tax EE rate of \$0.0265 per therm would be reduced to \$0.0133 per therm, for recovery of the SAVEGREEN program costs approved in the September 2010 Order, the January 2012 Order, the June 2013 Order, the July 2015 Order, the June 2016, Order, and the September 2018 Order. Based on the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> In re Energy Efficiency Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms and I/M/O the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of Energy Efficiency Programs with an Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism, BPU Docket Nos. EO09010056 and GO09010057, Order dated July 17, 2009 ("July 2009 Order"); In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas for Approval of Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GO10030225, Order dated September 24, 2010 ("September 2010 Order"); In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas for Approval of Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative Programs and Associated Cost Recovery Mechanisms Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GR11070425, Order dated January 19, 2012 ("January 2012 Order"); In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Extension of Energy Efficiency Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1 and In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Cost Recovery Associated with Energy Efficiency Program, BPU Docket Nos. GO12070640 and GR12070641, Order dated June 21, 2013 ("June 2013 Order"); In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Extension of Energy Efficiency Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GO14121412, Order dated July 23, 2015 ("July 2015 Order"); and In re the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of the Extension of Energy-Efficiency Programs and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1, BPU Docket No. GO14121412, Order dated June 29, 2016. ("June 2016 Order").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> <u>I/M/O the Petition of New Jersey Natural Gas Company for Approval of Existing and New Energy Efficiency</u> <u>Programs and a Class I Renewable Energy Program and the Associated Cost Recovery Mechanism Pursuant to</u> <u>N.J.S.A. 48:3-98.1</u>, BPU Docket No. GO18030355, Order dated September 17, 2018 ("September 2018 Order").

Company's request, the overall bill of a residential heating customer using 100 therms per month would decrease by \$1.32, or 1.3 percent.

## BACKGROUND

2. NJNG's participation in energy-efficiency programs, the costs of which are collected through Rider F, was originally approved by the Board in the July 2009 Order and subsequently approved to continue, with modifications, in the September 2010 Order, January 2012 Order, the June 2013 Order, the July 2015 Order, the June 2016 Order, and the recently approved September 2018 Order.

3. As stated by the Company in its Petition, the SAVEGREEN energy-efficiency and conservation programs are designed to complement and supplement aspects of New Jersey's Clean Energy Program ("NJCEP") in an attempt to encourage higher levels of customer participation in NJNG's service territory. NJNG maintains that the programs do not duplicate or eliminate any of the NJCEP programs; instead they work to increase customer awareness, enhance participation, and support utilization of NJCEP efforts throughout the State.

4. As set forth in the above-cited Board Orders, NJNG was authorized to establish a rate through which it can recover from customers SAVEGREEN costs including: rebates, customer incentive payments, customer financing, and associated reasonable and prudent incremental operation and maintenance ("O&M") expenses ("Program Costs"). It was agreed that such Program Costs are subject to recovery pursuant to the terms of Rider F.

5. NJNG is to submit an annual SAVEGREEN cost recovery filing by June 1<sup>st</sup> to establish future Rider F rates. The filing has usually been made coincident with, but separate from,

NJNG's annual Basic Gas Supply Service filing, and is to include updates to the SAVEGREEN investment levels, operating costs, and reconciled rate recoveries to actual cost results.

#### PROCEDURAL HISTORY

6. Since there was a rate reduction requested, public hearings on this Petition were not held.

7. NJNG has received and responded to all discovery requests that have been propounded in this proceeding by BPU Staff and Rate Counsel.

8. The Parties have discussed the matters at issue in this proceeding. Based upon those discussions, the Parties agreed to enter into this Stipulation, in resolution of certain issues raised in or relating to the Company's Petition.

9. Specifically, based upon and subject to the terms and conditions set forth herein, the Parties STIPULATE AND AGREE as follows:

#### STIPULATED MATTERS

10. The Parties agree that the Company is authorized to recover only those costs associated with the SAVEGREEN Programs previously approved in the September 2010, January 2012, June 2013, July 2015, June 2016, and September 2018 Orders.

11. Based on the Company's updated revenue requirement of \$8.880 million, the Parties agree that NJNG should reduce the existing EE Rate of \$0.0265 per therm, which includes SUT (\$0.0249 excluding SUT), to \$0.0133 per therm after-tax (\$0.0125 excluding SUT) pursuant

to the terms of Rider F of the Company's gas tariff, as set forth in Attachment A. The Company's updated revenue requirement reflects implications of the Tax Cuts and Jobs Act of 2017. The overall bill of the residential heating customer using 100 therms per month will decrease by \$1.32, or 1.3 percent. This rate shall be effective January 1, 2019 or as of the date approved in a Board Order and shall remain in effect until changed by a future Board Order.

12. The Parties agree that actual costs incurred prior to September 30, 2018, as shown in Attachment B, have been reviewed and deemed prudent and reasonable by the Parties. Actual costs incurred by NJNG after that date are subject to review for reasonableness and prudence in future EE Rate filings.

13. The Parties agree that the Company's next annual EE Rate filing will be made on or about June 1, 2019.

14. As agreed to by the Signatory Parties and authorized in the September 2010, January 2012, June 2013, July 2015, June 2016, and September 2018 Orders, any variance between costs and recoveries will accrue interest at a rate equal to the Company's monthly commercial paper rate. In the event that commercial paper was not utilized by the Company in the preceding month, the last calculated rate will be used. The interest rate shall not exceed the Company's rate of return as authorized by the BPU in the Company's most recent base rate case, BPU Docket No. GR15111304, or until changed by Board Order. Interest on over/under recoveries will be calculated using simple interest, based on the average beginning and ending over/under recovery balances for the month, on a net-of-tax basis. The sum of the monthly interest to be collected from or credited to ratepayers will be included in the rate calculations for the next annual EE Rate filing.

15. This Stipulation represents a mutual balancing of interests, contains interdependent provisions and, therefore, is intended to be accepted and approved in its entirety. In the event any

particular aspect of this Stipulation is not accepted and approved in its entirety by the Board, any Party aggrieved thereby shall not be bound to proceed with this Stipulation and shall have the right to litigate all issues addressed herein to a conclusion. More particularly, in the event this Stipulation is not adopted in its entirety by the Board in any applicable Order, then any Party hereto is free to pursue its then available legal remedies with respect to all issues addressed in this Stipulation as though this Stipulation had not been signed.

16. It is the intent of the Parties that the provisions hereof be approved by the Board as being in the public interest. The Parties further agree that they consider the Stipulation to be binding on them for all purposes herein.

17. It is specifically understood and agreed that this Stipulation represents a negotiated agreement and has been made exclusively for the purpose of these proceedings. Except as expressly provided herein, NJNG, BPU Staff, and Rate Counsel shall not be deemed to have approved, agreed to, or consented to any principle or methodology underlying or supposed to underlie any agreement provided herein and, in total or by specific item, is in no way binding upon them in any other proceeding, except to enforce the terms of this Stipulation.

**6** -

WHEREFORE, the Parties hereto do respectfully submit this Stipulation and request that the Board issue a Decision and Order approving it in its entirety, in accordance with the terms hereof, as soon as reasonably possible.

**NEW JERSEY NATURAL GAS COMPANY** PETITIONER

By: ANDREW K. DEMBIA

Regulatory Affairs Counsel

**NEW JERSEY DIVISION OF RATE COUNSEL** STEFANIE A. BRAND, DIRECTOR

KURT S. LEWANDOWSKI

Assistant Deputy Rate Counsel

GURBIR S. GREWAL ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW JERSEY Attorneys for Staff of the Board of Public Utilities

By: GREENBERG Deputy Attorney General

Date: December 6,2018

By:

## Attachment A

#### New Jersey Natural Gas Company Net impact of Proposed Rate Changes BPU Docket No. GR18050585 C/Y 2019

•		(\$/therm) 1/1/2019					
	Component of		rent Boot tox	Propos		Cha Pre-tax	nge Post-ta
EE	Delivery Price	Pre-tax 0.0249	Post-tax 0.0265	Pre-tax 0.0125	0.0133	(0.0124)	(0.013)
· .							
Impact on Reside	ential Non-Heating Custor	ners		25 therm bill			
10/1/18 Rates	0		\$8.70	\$8.70			
	Customer Charge Delivery		\$8.70 \$0.5734	\$6.70 \$14.34	•		
	BGSS		\$0.3646	\$9.12			
		Total	\$0.9380	\$32.15			
Proposed Rates-	effective 1/1/19						
•	Customer Charge		\$8.70	\$8.70			•
	Delivery BGSS		\$0.5602 \$0.3646	\$14.01 \$9.12			
	8888	Total	\$0.9248	\$31.82			
	Increase/(Decrease) Increase/(Decrease) as	a nercent		(\$0.33) (1.0%)		• .	
		- percent		(1.675)		•	
						•	
impact on Reside	ential Heating Customers	•			1,000 therm		
			,	100 therm bill	annuat bill		
10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge	•	\$8.70	\$8.70	\$104.40		
	Delivery		\$0.5273	\$52.73	\$527.30		
	BGSS		\$0.3646	\$36.46	\$364.60		
		Total	\$0.8919	\$97.89	\$996.30		
Proposed Rates-	effective 1/1/19						
	Customer Charge		\$8.70	. \$8.70	\$104.40		
	Delivery BGSS		\$0.5141	. \$51.41 \$36.46	\$514.10 \$364.60		
	8633	Total	\$0.3646 \$0.8787	\$96.57	\$983.10		۰.
	increase/(Decrease) increase/(Decrease) as			(\$1.32) (1.3%)	(\$13.20) (1.3%)		
	increase/(Decrease) as	s a percent		(1.5 %)	(1.376)		
impact on Comm	arcial GSS Customers		·				
	ercial GSS Customers		<u></u>	100 therm bill			
impact on Comm 10/1/18 Rates			506 37				
	nercial <u>GSS Customers</u> Customer Charge Delivery		\$26.37 \$0.4763	100 therm bill \$26.37 \$47.63			•
	Customer Charge		\$0.4763 \$0.3646	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46			•
	Customer Charge Delivery	Total	\$0.4763	\$26.37 \$47.63			•
10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46			•
	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS • effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37	\$26.37 \$47.63 <u>\$36.46</u> <u>\$110.46</u> \$26.37			
10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631	\$26.37 \$47.63 <u>\$36.46</u> <u>\$110.46</u> \$26.37 \$46.31			
10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS • effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge	Total Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37	\$26.37 \$47.63 <u>\$36.46</u> <u>\$110.46</u> \$26.37			
10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery		\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14			
10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS • effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease)	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$38.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32)			
10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS • effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) a:	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$38.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32)			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS • effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease)	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$38.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%)			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) a:	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$38.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32)			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates Impact on Comm	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS •effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) a: Increase/(Decrease) a: Increase/(Decrease) a: Customer Charge	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646 \$0.8277	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates Impact on Comm	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) a: increase/(Decrease) a: customer Charge Demand Charge	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3645 \$0.8277 \$0.8277 \$1.84	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$38.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17 \$176.64			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates Impact on Comm	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) at Increase/(Decrease) at Increase/(Decrease) at Customer Charge Demand Charge Delivery	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646 \$0.8277	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates Impact on Comm	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) a: increase/(Decrease) a: customer Charge Demand Charge	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646 \$0.8277 \$1.84 \$0.4279	\$26.37 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17 \$176.64 \$513.48			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates <u>Impact on Comm</u> 10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) an increase/(Decrease) an increase/(Decrease) an increase/(Decrease) an increase/(Decrease) and increase/(Decrease) and incre	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646 \$0.8277 \$1.84 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4370	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17 \$176.64 \$513.48 \$513.48			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates <u>Impact on Comm</u> 10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) at increase/(Decrease) at mercial GSL Customers Customer Charge Demand Charge Demand Charge Delivery BGSS (Oct 2018) - effective 1/1/19	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646 \$0.8277 \$1.84 \$0.4279 \$0.4370 \$0.8649	\$26.37 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17 \$176.64 \$513.48 \$524.40 \$1,266.69			
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates <u>Impact on Comm</u> 10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) an increase/(Decrease) an increase/(Decrease) an increase/(Decrease) an increase/(Decrease) and increase/(Decrease) and incre	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646 \$0.8277 \$1.84 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4370	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17 \$176.64 \$513.48 \$513.48			· ·
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates <u>Impact on Comm</u> 10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS •effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) at increase/(Decrease) at increase/(Decrease) at there increase inc	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3645 \$0.8277 \$1.84 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4370 \$0.8649 \$52.17 \$1.84 \$52.17 \$1.84 \$0.4147	\$26.37 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17 \$176.64 \$513.48 \$524.40 \$1,286.69 \$52.17 \$176.64			•
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates Impact on Comm	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) and Increase/(Decrease) and I	Total s a percent Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646 \$0.3646 \$0.8277 \$1.84 \$0.4279 \$0.4370 \$0.8649 \$52.17 \$1.84 \$0.4370	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17 \$176.64 \$513.48 \$524.40 \$1,266.69 \$52.17 \$176.64			•
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates <u>Impact on Comm</u> 10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS •effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) at increase/(Decrease) at increase/(Decrease) at there increase inc	Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3645 \$0.8277 \$1.84 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4279 \$0.4370 \$0.8649 \$52.17 \$1.84 \$52.17 \$1.84 \$0.4147	\$26.37 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17 \$176.64 \$513.48 \$524.40 \$1,286.69 \$52.17 \$176.64			•
10/1/18 Rates Proposed Rates <u>Impact on Comm</u> 10/1/18 Rates	Customer Charge Delivery BGSS •effective 1/1/19 Customer Charge Delivery BGSS Increase/(Decrease) at increase/(Decrease) at increase/(Decrease) at there increase inc	Total s a percent Total	\$0.4763 \$0.3646 \$0.8409 \$26.37 \$0.4631 \$0.3646 \$0.3646 \$0.8277 \$1.84 \$0.4279 \$0.4370 \$0.8649 \$52.17 \$1.84 \$0.4370	\$26.37 \$47.63 \$36.46 \$110.46 \$26.37 \$46.31 \$36.46 \$109.14 (\$1.32) (1.2%) 1200 therm bill \$52.17 \$176.64 \$513.48 \$524.40 \$1,266.69 \$52.17 \$176.64			•

Projected Annual Revenue

Projected SBC annual therms

709,249 (000s)

Projected Annual Revenue \$ million

T Tojected Allina		Proposed	
	Current Rates	Rates	Change
Pre-tax	\$17.66	\$8.87	(\$8.8)
Post-tax	\$18.80	\$9.43	(\$9.4)

# New Jersey Natural Gas Energy Efficiency Recovery Rates

(\$000)		
Astro-Linder/(Over) reservery at Contember 20, 2018	\$	(1.280)
Actual Under/(Over) recovery at September 30, 2018	Φ	(1,389)
Estimated Revenue Requirements (October 2018 through December 2018): RGGI	\$	59
EE Extension		88
July 2013 Programs		1,502
August 2015 Programs		1,929
Estimated Recovery	\$	(5,223)
Estimated Interest	_\$	(6)
Estimated Under/(Over) recovery at December 31, 2018	\$	(3,040)
Estimated Revenue Requirements (Jan 2019 through Dec 2019):		•
RGGI	\$	196
EE Extension		291
July 2013 Programs		4,246
August 2015 Programs		3,628
SAVEGREEN 2018		3,559
Total Amount to be Recovered	\$	8,880
Per Therm Recovery		
Firm Throughput (000 therms)		709,249
Proposed Pre-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm	\$	0.0125
Proposed After-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm	\$	0.0133
Current Pre-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm	\$	0.0249
Current After-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm	\$	0.0265
Pre-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm Increase/ (Decrease)	\$	(0.0124)
After-tax EE Recovery Rate \$ per Therm Increase/ (Decrease)	\$	(0.0132)